

Fisher Associates' Assessment of options against objectives and parameters

A qualitative assessment of each option's likelihood of meeting the objectives and parameters was been undertaken by Fisher Associates, using the following scale:

✓✓ strong positive impact XX strong adverse impact -- neutral
 ✓ positive impact X adverse impact

	1. Single SHA: Municipal Port	2. Single SHA: State Port	3. Two SHAs: A&BC extends	4. Two SHAs: CMAL extends	5. Single SHA: Trust Port	6. Multi SHAs: Additional Trust Port	7. Single SHA: Hybrid Port	8. Single SHA: CLG Port
Objectives								
To manage marine safety risk ALARP	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓
To better inform/ educate mariners	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓
To safely/efficiently accommodate future aspirations	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓
To develop coordinated approach to management	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓
Parameters								
A&BC and/or CMAL lose statutory powers without compensation	XX	XX	✓	✓	XX	✓	X	X
Buy-in and participation of wider stakeholders	✓✓	XX	✓	--	X	✓	✓✓	✓✓
Minimising financial impact on port users/ Affordability/VFM	✓	✓✓	--	✓	X	XX	✓	X
CalMac Ferries to meet obligations	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓
Deliverability	XX	XX	✓	✓✓	XX	XX	X	X

OCHDA assessment of revised options against objectives and parameters

Based on the qualitative assessment of each option's likelihood of meeting the objectives and parameters, as previously undertaken by Fisher Associates, using the following scale:

√√ strong positive impact XX strong adverse impact -- neutral
 √ positive impact X adverse impact

	1. Two SHAs: Municipal Port	2. Two SHAs: CMAL extends	3. Trust Port based on N Pier
Objectives			
To manage marine safety risk ALARP	✓	✓	✓✓
To better inform/educate mariners	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓
To safely/efficiently accommodate future aspirations	✓	✓	✓✓
To develop coordinated approach to management	✓	✓	✓✓
Parameters			
A&BC and/or CMAL lose statutory powers without compensation	✓	✓	✓
Buy-in and participation of wider stakeholders	✓	XX	✓✓
Minimising financial impact on port users/Affordability/VFM	--	✓	✓
CalMac Ferries to meet obligations	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓
Deliverability	X	✓✓	✓✓